



## Print Media Frames on the Innocence of Muslims film conflict: A Case Study of Four South Indian Newspapers from September 15, 2012 - September 25, 2012.

## KEYWORDS

Dinamani, Dinakaran, Dinathanthi, Dinamalar, Muslims, Film Dispute

**M. P. Ameerul Hasan**

Ph.D Research Scholar, Department of Journalism and Mass Communication, Periyar University, Salem-636 011

**R. Subramani**

Department of Journalism and Mass Communication Periyar University, Salem – 636 011, Tamil Nadu, India.

**ABSTRACT**

The media carry out their role as an ideological instrument by shaping, distributing, and reproducing the limits of legitimate discourse. This paper analyzes South Indian newspaper coverage of the film disputes 'Innocence of Muslims' and how media framing of catastrophic events has affected the public. Having established a research framework, a content analysis on four newspapers viz. Dinamani, Dinakaran, Dinathanthi, Dinamalar, coverage to learn more about print media frames on the innocence Muslims film conflict. The Print media frames like news angle, news sources, articles analyzed, story type, attribution, quoted sources, articles tone, language of the story, tone of the headline, articles by framing, articles about the dispute, agenda setting provided by the newspapers on a whole, Overall impression about the story, Psychological outcome of the story, were analyzed. In order to achieve a balanced perspective, this content analysis utilizes a combination of larger publications and smaller market publications like Muslim and non- Muslim's ideological views.

**Introduction**

India is a land of many languages, cultures and religions. It is an ideal place where one can see the minorities in their different dimensions. There are ethnic, religious and linguistic variations among the people of India from ancient times. Islam occupies an important place in the religious and socio-political life of India and demonstrates a certain uniqueness which reflects its essential, unmistakable and inevitable interaction with the Indian culture and social structure at various stages of its historical development and operations in this subcontinent. While Islam in India has been the same in principle as Islam elsewhere, it has acquired and produced certain special qualities related to its Indian environment. On the other hand, Muslims in India, confronted by their day-to-day problems, have constantly available to them ideas, institutions and leaders from outside India in the wider Muslim world.

**Muslim images in the Media**

The media, particularly from the West, seems to feature Islam constantly in the negative light<sup>1,2</sup>. The portrayal of the negative image of Islam by media takes place by constructing an image of Islam with terrorism, violence, extremism and antipathy to the West<sup>3</sup>. A more recent phenomenon of Western media towards Islam is the fanning of Islamophobia a form of concerted efforts directed to frighten the world of the hostility and enmity imposed by Islam. As much as the media can disrepute the general Muslim population and Islam, it can also restore and further inform the public of the true image of the religion<sup>4-6</sup>. There is compelling evidence that many among the world's Muslims endorse no such rejection of modernity and democracy. The various forms of media, for example, the news media, radio and television broadcasts and digital communication such as the internet are indeed important providers of information and news. Those in the media are professionals and are supposed to not only publish newspapers to disseminate the truth, but to serve the community with genuine news. In addition, social issues must be analyzed and reported truthfully. Processes of stereotyping the community with the help of media and anti-Muslim organizations are adding to the confusion. However, it would be a perpetuation of such objectification to deny Muslims any agency in the production of media images and representations.

With the above implications, the objective of the present investigation is set to analyze the detailed description about the anti-Islam video, ie., Innocence of Muslims. Demonstrations and violent protests against the film broke out on September 11 in Egypt and Libya, and spread to other Arab and Muslim nations and some western countries<sup>7</sup>. Thus with a renewing interest, the impact about this film, procured by

Tamil Nadu regional newspapers viz. Dinamani, Dinakaran, Dinathanthi, Dinamalar have been well reflected in this paper on scrutinizing through various angles.

**Method of study**

To examine how South- Indian regional newspapers framed the film dispute and therefore the work has been conducted on the content analysis of newspaper articles published in four national newspapers viz. Dinamani, Dinakaran, Dinathanthi, Dinamalar. Therefore, this study will provide a meaningful insight as to how the film dispute was framed from September 15, 2012 – September 25, 2012. Studies encloses number of Articles Analyzed, articles by Story type, articles by attribution, articles by quoted sources, articles tone, language of the story, tone of the headline, articles by framing, articles about the dispute, agenda setting provided by the newspapers on a whole, intensity of the coverage, overall impression about the story, psychological outcome of the story.

**Results and Discussion:****Number of Articles Analyzed:**

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Number of articles	13		18	20	51
Total	13	Nil	18	20	51

News about this film has been published and discussed in the four news papers taken. For about 51 articles have been printed in the 11 days. In that, 13 in Dinathanthi, 18 in Dinakaran, in 20 in Dinamani has been Discussed. Contrarily no issues have been given by Dinamalar daily.

**Articles by Story type:**

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
News	13		18	18	49
Feature					
Comment					
Letter to the editor				1	1
Editorial				1	1
Total	13	Nil	18	20	51

Based as story form, in Dinathanthi 13 news has been given whereas in Dinakaran and Dinamani it was 18. But in Dinamalar there was no issues discussed in regard to this film. To point out on feature, comment, letters to editor and editorial no subject has been discussed in the case of Dinathanthi, Dinakaran, Dinamalar, but there was issue at the letters to the editors in Dinamani. Also in editorial there has been found many lines at the negative part of this film. All the newspapers taken under the present study has given importance to the news based issues, rather than other forms of matter.

#### Articles by Attribution:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Named author				2	2
No byline	13		18	18	49
Wire service					
Correspondent					
Total	13	Nil	18	20	51

No news has found at the named authors Column, whereas 13 news were published with no by line. Also no wire service of correspondent news has been recorded, at Dinathanthi. Here too no issues and news were found to be in Dinamalar. Alike Dinakaran, no news was seen in Dinathanthi, except 18 news with no by-line. Coming to Dinamani, 2 news based on named by author and 18 news with no by line has been published. rest has not been given any importance. In Dinathanthi, no news has been recorded in named author section. Whereas 13 news has been published in no by line. Also no news at the wire service section and correspondent, conclusion- rather than named author, wire service and correspondent, all the newspapers has given importance only to no by line news.

#### Articles by Quoted Sources:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Sources					
Governmental bodies	8		3	8	19
Pro - Muslim groups	2		6	6	14
Anti - Muslim Groups	2		1	2	5
Police	1		1		2
Legal					
Public				1	1
Social Activists					
Total	13	Nil	11	17	41

In Dinathanthi, no news has been published on the existence of sours but based on no-sources there has been 13 news published. No news has been discussed about this topic in Dinamalar. Like Dinathanthi, in Dinakaran and Dinamani 18-news has been published on-sources Based on no sources format Dinathanthi, Dinakaran and Dinamani have given lot most interest compared to other forms of news. On quoted source news, in Dinathanthi, 8 news has been give at the column governmental bodies 2 news at pro-Muslim group, 1 news at anti- Muslims groups and 1 new at police Column. As being in agreement with the above heading discussed, no news have been flashed by Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, 3 news on governmental bodies, 6 - news at pro - Muslims, 1- news at anti-Muslims 1 -news at police issues has been given. In Dinamani, 8 news though: governmental bodies" 6 - news through pro- Muslims group", 2- news in anti-Muslim news, 2- news by pubic has been published. Comparing the three papers except Dinamalar, more news has been given in governmental bodies. Under this section, majority of news has not given right hand to pro- Muslims & anti-Muslim group, but to government bodies. Issues on legal, public, social activities were seen to taken place less.

#### Articles Tone:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Tone					
Pro - Muslim	4		8	4	16
Anti - Muslim	7		4	7	18
sensationalization	3		4	6	13
Trivialization				1	1
Titillation					
Total	14	Nil	16	18	48

In Dinathanthi, 3,7 and 3news has been recorded based on pro- Muslims, anti- Muslims & sensationalization aspects. None of these issues has been given in Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, 8 news on pro-Muslims, 4 news on anti-Muslims, 4- news on sensationalization topic has been given. In Dinamani, 1-news regarding trivialization, 6 rag sensationalization, 7 on anti- Muslims, 4 on pro-Muslims have been taken part. Whereas, in Dinakaran and Dinamani, majority of the issues has been written based on anti-Muslims and in Dinakaran pro-Muslim news has been written as main theme. It was hand absurd that there were no single news printed at the section Trivialization, Titillation, contrastingly there were quite good number of news bases on " anti-Muslim".

#### Language of the story:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Positive	2		8	2	12
Negative	5		4	10	19
Neutral	5		4	6	15
Total	12	Nil	16	18	46

With published general news, by analyzing the language impact, there were 2 news with positive, 2 news with negative impact and 5 with neutral have been recorded by Dinakaran. As usual, no news were seen in Dinamalar . 8 positive news and 4 negative and neutral has been given by Dinakaran. Much of the positive news were given on Dinakaran , as inferred from this particular analysis. With regard to Dinamani, 2 positive news, 120 -negative news has been given. These imposing a negative aspect about this particular film issue. Moreover, 6 neutral news has been published which is convicting alone with positive news. Though there were positive, negative or neutral news been evolved, negative aspect of news only has been seen to be focused more.

#### Tone of the Headline:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Educative					
Informative			7	7	14
Sensational	13		7	9	23
Commercial					
Total	13	Nil	14	16	43

Based on headlines, there can be given much more ideas about any issues. Hence, in Dinakaran, 13 news have been procured based on sensational. Contrastingly on importance were given for contrastingly, no importance was given for informative, commercial and educative news. No news at Dinamalar regarding any of these issues. In Dinakaran, news very informative was ranked as 7, 7as sensational, but no news at education and commercial column. In Dinamani, 7 news as informative and sensational covering 9 news were recorded. Totally no issues or news have been given importance to educative and commercial purpose at the headline column. There has been a bundle of news recorded based on

sensational type whereas an opposite sense has been given for educative and commercial purpose of news.

#### Articles by Framing:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Religious frame	3		3	5	11
Political frame	5		3	2	10
Violence frame	1		5	5	11
Extremism	1			3	3
Law and order frame	2		3	2	7
International Dispute	2		2	2	6
Total	13	Nil	16	19	48

At article framing analysis, in Dinathanthi, 3 news were published. For religious frame 3 news and political frame 3 news, has been recorded. 1 news each were recorded based on violence frame, extremism and law-order, 2- news on international frame has been measured. In Dinamalar, no news have been published regarding any of above aspects. In Dinakaran, 3 news on religious framing, political framing and law and order has been recorded. 5 news on violence frame, 2- news on international frame has also been taken place. In Dinamani, 5 news on religious frame, 2 news on political frame and violence frame have been studied. Additionally, 3 on extremism, 2 on law and order, 2 on international has been published. Though there were many other news seen to prevail, main importance has been given to violence framing.

#### Articles about the Dispute:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Anti-National approach	7		6	8	21
Prevent the conflict	3		4	4	11
Trigger the violence				2	2
Peace building measure	2		1	2	5
Voice on human rights					
Upholding the Fundamental rights					
Total	12	Nil	11	16	39

In Dinakaran, 7 news on anti national approach, 3 on prevent the conflict, 2 on voice on human rights, have been recorded. No news has been published by Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, 6 news on antinational issues, 1 news on peace building measure, measure, 4 on prevent the conflict has been measured. In Dinamani, 8 news on antinational, 4 on prevent on conflict, 2 on trigger the violence and peace building measure have been recorded. This anti-national news has been major issues. Though there were no news on voice on human right and upholding the Fundamental Rights, many discussions have been seen on anti-national approach, being convincing.

#### Agenda setting provided by the newspapers on a whole:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
The film trailer must be removed	6		6	2	14
Muslims must stop the agitations	5		7	6	18
Total	11	Nil	13	8	32

There was a strong point given on the removal of trailer enclosing 6 news on Dinathanthi Muslims must stop agitations. No issues or news regarding these issues have been given on Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, 6 news on film trailer remove and 7 news on Muslims must stop the agitations. In Dinamani, 2 news on film trailer remove: and 6 news on Muslims must stop the agitation. These regional newspapers have given

importance to Muslims must stop agitations rather than the violence produced by film trailer.

#### Overall impression about the story:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Support the Muslim cause	2		7	4	13
Oppose the Muslims Cause	9		3	8	20
Support the Film Maker				1	1
oppose the Film Maker	2		3	4	9
Total	13	Nil	14	17	43

In Dinathanthi, totally 2 news on support the Muslim cause and 9 news on support the Muslim cause and 9 news oppose the film maker has taken place. Hence this news paper has seemed to give importance to opposing the film making. No issues have seen to be discussed in Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, totally 7 news on support the Muslim cause and support the film maker has been discussed. In Dinamani, 4 news on support the Muslims cause, 8 on oppose the Muslim cause and 1 on support the film, 4 on oppose the film maker has been published Almost all the subjected regional papers have given importance to oppose the Muslims cause under this section.

#### Psychological outcome of the story:

Newspapers	Dinathanthi	Dinamalar	Dinakaran	Dinamani	Total
Sympathy on Muslims	3		6	2	11
Empathy on Muslims	2		4	2	8
No impact	6		6	10	22
Total	11	Nil	16	14	41

In Dinathanthi, 3 news on sympathy on Muslims, 2 on empathy on Muslim story, 6 on no impact on the study has been measured. As obvious, none of these issues have been given by Dinamalar. In Dinakaran, 6 news on sympathy on Muslims, 4 on empathy on Muslims, 6 on no impact on the study have been published. In Dinamani, 2 on sympathy on Muslims, 2 on sympathy on Muslims, 2 on empathy, 10 on no impact has discussed. Despite fact that there were found news based on sympathy and empathy, no-impact, based news has been given a mainstream importance when comparing the total issues.

#### Conclusion

From the results of the present investigation, it can be inferred that the film dispute has been very vastly discussed on various forms in all the newspapers. Negative aspects have been discussed by Dinakaran with high impact compared to others; contrastingly Dinamalar has not provided such brunt over the film. Complete profile about this peculiar issue has been listed clearly in simple mannered way for a greater clarity covering the most important regional newspapers. Through the media, the proper propagation and understanding of Islam can be enhanced by highlighting the universal values of the teachings of Islam. The media is a very important tool for effective communication and dissemination about Islam which the Muslim world could utilize. Quite to the contrary, the bothering of Muslims and the objectification experienced by Muslims in media products are of serious political and scholarly concern with implications for the lives of those involved.

**REFERENCE**

1. Nacos B.L., - Torres-Reyna, O. (2007) Fueling our fears: Stereotyping, media coverage, and public opinion of Muslim Americans. Lanham, MD: Row man & Littlefield |
2. Poole, E. (2002) Reporting Islam: Media representations of British Muslims. London: IB Tauris & Co. |
3. Asian Social Science (2012) Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education 263 |
4. Mohd. Shuhaimi Bin Haji Ishak - Sohirin Mohammad Solihin,(2012 ) Islam and Media, Vol. 8, No. 7 |
5. Kincheloe, J. (2001) Getting beyond the facts: Teaching social studies/social sciences in the twenty-first century, New York: Peter Lang. |
6. Shaheen, J.(2001) Reel bad Arabs, Brooklyn: Olive Branch Press. |
7. Zelizer, B. and S. Allan. (2001), Journalism after September 11. London: Rout ledge. |